

### Institution: Liverpool Hope University

## Unit of Assessment: C21 Politics and International Studies

**Title of case study:** The impact of Europeanisation on Irish public policy: Ireland, the Treaty of Lisbon referendum and beyond

### **1. Summary of the impact** (indicative maximum 100 words)

The research contributed to the public information campaign which was conducted as part of the referendum campaigns on the Treaty of Lisbon in Ireland, as well as more generally impacting on how referendums are run; this includes up to the Fiscal Stability Treaty referendum on 30 May 2013. It forms part of the authors' overall research on the impact of Europeanisation on the governance of Irish institutions and public policy processes which has been ongoing since 1997 and has impact on public understanding, political institutions and socialisation agents (parties and interest groups).

#### 2. Underpinning research (indicative maximum 500 words)

Rees and Holmes have published together (see Coakley, Rees and Holmes 1997) and separately since 1989 on Ireland and the European Union, especially on the debates on and running of EU referendums in Ireland. Holmes was entered in the RAE 2008 and has been at Hope throughout the census period whilst Rees joined as Professor of International Politics in 2008. Rees and Holmes have examined how opposition to European Integration has emerged around specific referenda in Ireland. Holmes (2005) conducted an analysis of campaign documents, press statements, and other material produced by parties and groups that have campaigned for No votes in Ireland's EU referendums. The objective was to identify and categorise the various different groups that have campaigned for No votes in Ireland's European referendums, to categorise the different issues that they have concentrated on, to map the linkages between groups and issues, and to identify the strategies enabling a rather disparate set of actors to work together. This resulted in the publication of a chapter in an edited volume (Holmes 2005). A more recent study by Holmes (2008) looked at the referendum over the Lisbon Treaty whilst in 2012, Holmes has also analysed the responses of the Irish Labour Party to European integration. Holmes's work contributes to the context for this impact case study in two ways: his analyses of the impact of European integration on the Irish Labour Party add to an understanding of the general impact of integration on Irish society and politics and his work on the persistence and development of opposition to integration in Ireland forms part of the backdrop for considering the problems faced in ratification of the Treaty of Lisbon and the Fiscal Stability Treaty.

Rees has published an annual review (2005 to date) on Ireland and the EU, including looking at referendums, in the *German Yearbook of European Integration* (Institute for European Politics/Nomos) and he has also undertaken an annual evaluation of Irish foreign policy 1994-2011, which includes an examination of Ireland's role in the EU. This annual review is published in *Irish Studies in International Affairs* (1994-2011: Royal Irish Academy). This draws on interviews with officials and other sources including from the Departments of Foreign Affairs, Defence and the Taoiseach, as well as the Oireachtas. The journal is circulated by the Department of Foreign Affairs. Rees argues in his research that the EU has had a significant impact on how Irish public policy in Ireland adapted to Europe and how policy learning occurred. However, he questions the degree to which this is embedded in the Irish public policy process.

The various referenda on EU treaty changes provide key points at which the impact of Europeanisation in Ireland is publically debated and voted on. Rees, Quinn and Connaughton carried out research interviews with personnel in Irish government departments, agencies and in regional/local authorities as part of a project looking at Europeanisation in Ireland between 2006 and 2009, which resulted in the publication of a book on *Europeanisation and new patterns of* 

## Impact case study (REF3b)



*governance in Ireland* and a chapter within this volume (Connaughton, Quinn, Rees 2010). This built on an earlier EU 5<sup>th</sup> Framework project which examined state adaptation and policy learning in regional and environmental policy in Cohesion & CEEC states. This was disseminated via public seminars, including in Brussels (European Commission), Dublin and the Mid-West in Ireland to EU, national and local officials, as well as through reports to DG Research (EU Commission) and the creation of a web site for dissemination. It was published as an EU report and as *EU Enlargement and Multi-Level Governance in Public Policy-Making* (2006) (Rees co-editor).

3. References to the research (indicative maximum of six references)

- N. Rees (2008) "Rhetoric or Reality: Responding to the Challenge of Sustainable Development and New Governance Patterns in Ireland" (with B Connaughton and B Quinn) in Susan Baker and K Eckerberg (eds). *In Pursuit of Sustainable Development: New Governance Practices at the Sub-National Level in Europe*, London: Routledge:145-68
- 2. N. Rees, B. Quinn and B. Connaughton (2010) *Europeanisation and new patterns of governance in Ireland* (Manchester University Press)
- 3. N. Rees (annual) "Ireland's foreign relations", in *Irish studies in international affairs. National Committee for the Study of International Affairs, Royal Irish Academy, Dublin* Available at : <u>http://ria.ie/publications/journals/irish-studies-in-international-affairs.aspx</u>
- 4. N Rees (annual) *Jahruch der Europäischen Integration* edited by Werner Weidenfeld and Wolfgang Wessels (Nomos) <u>http://www.nomos-shop.de/Weidenfeld-Wessels-Jahrbuch-</u> Europ%C3%A4ischen-Integration-2011/productview.aspx?product=14346
- 5. M. Holmes (2005) "The development of opposition to European integration in Ireland", in M. Holmes (ed.) *Ireland and the European Union: Nice, enlargement and the future of Europe* (Manchester University Press): 75-93
- M Holmes (2008) "The referendum on the Treaty of Lisbon in the Republic of Ireland, 12 June 2008", *Referendum briefing paper no. 16*, European Parties, Elections and Referendums Network, Sussex European Institute, University of Sussex, available online at <u>https://www.sussex.ac.uk/webteam/gateway/file.php?name=epern-ref-no16.pdf&site=266</u>
- 7. M. Holmes and K. Roder, eds (2012) *The Left and the European Constitution: From Laeken to Lisbon* (Manchester University Press)

Outside of current REF period but relates to earlier research collaboration continued after 2008:

N Rees, M Holmes, J Coakley (1997) "The Irish Response to European Integration: Explaining the Persistence of Opposition" in: *Europe's Ambiguous Unity: Conflict and Consensus in Post-Maastricht Europe* Alan W Cafruny and C Lankowski (eds.) Boulder, Col. : Lynne Rienner: 209-238

N. Rees *EU Enlargement and Multi-Level Governance in Public Policy-Making* (eds.) London: Ashgate (May 2006) (co-editors Christos J Paraskevopoulos, LSE and Panagiotis Getimis, Panteoin University)

# 4. Details of the impact (indicative maximum 750 words)

The research of Rees and Holmes has over the years involved looking at the impact of the EU (Europeanisation) on Ireland, as well as Ireland's role in Europe. In the context of Ireland, which is a small EU member state, there is considerable opportunity for academics to work closely with government officials, elected representatives and government ministers. In effect, Ireland is tightly networked and much of the research being undertaken is available to and informs policy debates and public discussion. This is evident through the work of the Institute for International and European Affairs (IIEA)—Ireland's leading think-tank in this area--and the Royal Irish Academy (RIA). Rees has played a role in both bodies, previously being part of IIEA governing body and a committee member of RIA International Affairs Committee. In both these bodies, there is close interplay and involvement of officials and academics. The research undertaken in this study can be traced back to 1997, when Rees and Holmes first analysed the use of EU referenda in Ireland



(Coakley, Holmes and Rees 1997).

Rees and Holmes have sought in their earlier research to ensure that it informs and impacts on an understanding of the impact of Europeanisation on Irish public policy (especially regional and environmental policy), political institutions and socialisation agents (parties, interest groups). Prior to this, Rees's research on Europeanisation and Ireland (2006, 2010) and that of Holmes (2005, 2008) have aimed to have such an impact on the debates over Ireland's role in the European Union, and the impact of the EU on Ireland. This has previously led to EU funded research being disseminated via workshops in Brussels attended by EU Commission officials (2003, 2004); dissemination of results via publication of specific country reports and an integrated comparative report (2004-05, 2006, 2008), and a public workshop for local / regional authorities and other state and private actors in the Mid-West Region in Ireland (2004). All of this has contributed to a better public understanding of the impact of the EU on Irish public policy.

This trend was continued in the current impact case study which focuses principally on the research undertaken by Rees and Holmes around the Lisbon Treaty referendum. This referendum was held in Ireland (June 2008) to enable Ireland to ratify the EU Treaty of Lisbon (signed 13 December 2007). Ireland was the only one of the 27 EU member states to hold a referendum to ratify the Treaty. On this occasion (7<sup>th</sup> EU referendum), the people voted "No" to the Treaty, leading eventually to a second referendum in October 2009, in which the "Yes" vote won the day. In each of the cases, an amendment to the Irish Constitution (Bunreacht Na hÉireann, Article 29.4) was required, which necessitated the holding of a referendum, which has led to a number of legal challenges which have required consideration by the Supreme Court (see *Crotty v. An Taoiseach* in 1987). This most recently happened in 2013 over the ninth referendum held on the EU Fiscal Stability Treaty on 31 May 2013 (Rees, forthcoming 2013, *Jahruch der Europäischen Integration*).

As a consequence of these challenges and the problems associated with the conduct of previous referenda, there has been considerable concern to ensure that public debate over the issues are informed by expert and academic commentary, as much as by political debate between differing sides in the referenda. As a result of the research undertaken jointly with Holmes as well as independently, Rees was invited as an expert commentator to participate in the public deliberations of the Joint Committee on European Affairs at its public meeting in Limerick. The meeting aimed to provide information, as well as answers, around the implications of the Treaty of Lisbon for Ireland. In these contexts, much of the discussion has tended to focus on the benefits and costs of EU membership to Ireland. The research by Rees on Europeanisation in Ireland aims to provide an explanation of and inform debate about the benefits and costs of EU membership, especially in the context of new treaty provisions in the Lisbon Treaty. In particular, Rees's research on Irish security policy aimed to provide further analysis of the implications of the EU treaty revision for Irish "neutrality" and Ireland's security commitments to the EU arising from such treaty change. Rees also went on to speak at and provide information briefings at party run information sessions during the referendum.

Following the initial failure of the Treaty of Lisbon at the June referendum, there was considerable debate and discussion in Ireland regarding what would happen next. In the context of this discussion, the Joint Committee on the Constitution decided in September 2008 to undertake a review of the constitutional framework governing the constitutional referendum process. Arising out of Rees's on-going research—now based at Hope and in continuing interrogation of the shifting scene--he was invited to address an Oireachtas (Irish parliament) Committee on the Constitution on the referendum process. The broader aim of the committee was to foster public debate on and awareness of Irish membership of the European Union following the 'No' result in the first referendum on the Treaty of Lisbon on 12 June 2008.

The testimony by Rees was the focus of debate and discussion by the parliamentary members of the committee and the work of the committee (including testimony by witnesses) was reported on in the media. A report on the testimony was included in the official parliamentary records of the Oireachtas Joint Committee on the Constitution and published as a separate report by the Oireachtas (http://www.oireachtas.ie/documents/committees30thdail/jconstitution/report\_2008/Report20090402.pdf



). It subsequently formed part of the citizens' advice information provided by the Referendum Commission (the body charged with providing neutral and unbiased information on all referendums on the constitution of the Republic of Ireland).

A number of communities and groups availed of the research including Irish politicians, especially those most active in EU affairs, such as the Taoiseach Enda Kenny (Fine Gael), as well as Irish lobby groups, such as those active in EU affairs. The research and the direct impact associated with it might also have contributed to shaping public attitudes on the EU, since it put forward a generally positive picture of Irish involvement with the EU and since the outcome of the second Treaty of Lisbon referendum on 2 October 2009 was a 'Yes' vote. However, this cannot be proven, given the variety of those involved in contributing to the information campaign. It should, however, be noted that research published on the outcome of the second Lisbon Treaty referendum highlights the importance of ensuring that high quality information is available to the electorate and that it is provided in a timely manner. The provision of such information on such complicated matters as treaty reform is critical to ensuring that the public engage and vote in referendums.

5. Sources to corroborate the impact (indicative maximum of 10 references)

Houses of the Oireachtas (Irish Parliament), Joint Committee on the Constitution, 2<sup>nd</sup> Report, April 2009. Rees's presentation to the committee is included in the report <a href="http://www.oireachtas.ie/documents/committees30thdail/j-constitution/report\_2008/Report20090402.pdf">http://www.oireachtas.ie/documents/committees30thdail/j-constitution/report\_2008/Report20090402.pdf</a>

Letter of invitation from the Chairman of the Joint Committee on European Affairs, Oireachtas (Irish Parliament), 2008 to address the committee

Copy of letter from Vincent Gribbin, Head of Internal Communications, Fine Gael, Dublin, 2008 inviting Rees to address the Lisbon Forum (Party Lisbon Information Campaign which included independent academic experts)

Report of the Oireachtas Committee on European Affairs, Plenary Sitting in Limerick, 2008. Rees was part of the panel that addressed the Plenary Session.

http://oireachtasdebates.oireachtas.ie/Debates%20Authoring/DebatesWebPack.nsf/committeetakes/EU J2008051500003

Letter from Darragh Kelly, Fine Gael Western Area Regional Coordinator to Professor Nicholas Rees to address the Public Forum on Lisbon Treaty, 2008 (Party Lisbon Information Campaign, which included independent academic experts)